UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

---X

Entral Group International, LLC,

    Plaintiff

- against -

YHCL Vision Corp and Jeff Chen,

    Defendants

Sam Chan and Ray Yim, Interested Parties

---X

CV-05-1912 (ERK) (RLM)

<u>ORDER</u>

FILED
IN CLERK'S OFFICE
U.S. DISTRICT COURT E.D.N.Y.

★ JUN 14 2006 ★

BROOKLYN OFFICE

KORMAN, Chief Judge.

    David J. Hoffman, counsel for Sam Chan, Ray Yim, and the North America Karaoke-works Trade Association, has objected to United States Magistrate Judge Mann's decision to allow Sam Chan to be deposed. Judge Mann stated her reasons on the record. Mr. Hoffman has not provided me with a transcript of her ruling. On the basis of what Mr. Hoffman has submitted, I cannot determine if the order was clearly erroneous or contrary to law. See Fed. R. Civ. Pro. 72. Nevertheless, if inappropriate questions are asked at the deposition or if the manner in which it is conducted becomes oppressive, our local rules provide for an immediate opportunity to raise these concerns to the Magistrate Judge. See EDNY/SDNY Civ. R. 37.3.

    In his letter of June 6, 2006, Mr. Hoffman objects to Judge Mann's denial of his protective order barring the disclosure of Mr. Chan's Social Security number (SSN) and requiring redaction of Mr. Yim's SSN from his deposition transcript. For reasons stated in a separate opinion I reverse Judge Mann's order and grant the motion for a protective order on the ground that the plaintiff has provided no plausible reason for the potential invasion of privacy that disclosure would entail.

c/f

Finally, Mr. Hoffman objects to Judge Mann's refusal to order the destruction of videotapes of the depositions of Messrs. Yim and Chan. As such videotapes are permissible under the Federal Rules, it was not clearly erroneous to refuse to order the videotapes destroyed simply because the subpoenas did not specify that the depositions would be videotaped.

<div align="center">SO ORDERED.</div>

Brooklyn, New York
June 7, 2006

<div align="right">
s/Edward R. Korman

Edward R. Korman
United States District Judge
</div>